

# **National Translation Mission (NTM)**

Central Institute of Indian Languages, Mysore

## **Minutes of the Second Meeting of the NTM-Project Advisory Committee**

The second meeting of the NTM Project Advisory Committee was held on 6<sup>th</sup> May 2010 at 10:30 a.m. in the committee room of the Sahitya Akademi, 35 Rabindra Bhavan, Feroz Shah Road, New Delhi 110 001. The meeting was **chaired by Dr. Anita Bhatnagar Jain**, Joint Secretary (L), Department of Higher Education, MHRD and the following PAC members attended it:

1. Shri. R P Sisodia, Director (Languages), MHRD
2. Shri. Navin Soi, Director (Finance), representing AS&FA, MHRD
3. Prof. Bijay Kumar, Chairman, CSTT, New Delhi.
4. Dr. Agrahara Krishna Murthy, Secretary, Sahitya Akademi, New Delhi.
5. Shri. Pankaj Chaturvedi, Assistant Editor representing NBT, New Delhi.
6. Prof. S. Radhakrishnan, Head, Dept. of Translation Studies, Tamil University, Thanjavur, Tamil Nadu.
7. Prof. Vanamala Vishwanatha, Dept. of English, Bangalore University, Bangalore, Karnataka.
8. Dr. Pradhan Gurudatt, Chairperson, Karnataka Anuvada Academy, Bangalore, Karnataka.
9. Dr. Zafar Iqbal Manhas, Secretary, J & K Academy of Art, Culture and Languages, Jammu and Kashmir.
10. Shri. Arun Kumar Sharma representing Akhil Bharatiya Prakashak Sangh, New Delhi.
11. Shri. Praveen Dev, Commissioning Editor, Pearson Education Pvt. Ltd., Patparganj, Delhi.
12. Dr. R.M.K. Sinha, Professor, IIT, Kanpur, Uttar Pradesh.
13. Dr. Nirmal Kanti Bhattacharjee, Director, B.M.Birla Academy, New Delhi.
14. Prof. Prakash Patnaik, Head, Dept. of MIL, Delhi University, Delhi.
15. Dr. K. Satchidanandan, Former Secretary, Sahitya Akademi, New Delhi.
16. Dr. Manoj Patairia, National Council for Science & Technology Communication, Technology Bhavan, New Delhi.
17. Dr. Mini Krishnan, Oxford University Press, Oxford House, Chennai, Tamil Nadu.
18. Prof. Rajesh Sachdeva, Director I/C, CIIL (Member Secretary)

Dr. Aditi Mukherjee was a special invitee of the Ministry to the meeting. The meeting was also attended by Dr. P.P. Giridhar, Head, NTM, CIIL, Mysore, and Dr. Srinivasacharya, Co-ordinator (Publications), NTM, CIIL, Mysore. Dr. Y Sridhar Reddy, Academic Secretary, CIIL, Mysore was the organiser of the meeting.

The following six PAC members could not attend the meeting:

1. Shri. Eno C. Panlook, Ekta Book House Pvt. Ltd., Siliguri, West Bengal.
2. Prof. Karuna Sindhu Das, Vice-Chancellor, Rabindra Bharati University, Kolkata, West Bengal.
3. Prof. Jayati Ghosh, Professor, JNU, New Delhi & Member, National Knowledge Commission

4. Prof. Harish Trivedi, Professor of English, Delhi
5. Prof. A.M. Pathan, Vice-Chancellor, Central University of Karnataka, Karnataka.
6. Dr. Swarn Lata, Senior Director, TDIL, Ministry of Communications and Information Technology, New Delhi.

#### **INTRODUCTORY REMARKS BY THE CHAIRPERSON**

The meeting began with the Chairperson welcoming the members. She remarked how the task that is at hand is ambitious and exciting. She then introduced herself and her colleagues from the Ministry. She invited the members to introduce themselves as it had been more than a year since they met the last time. After the introduction by the members, the Chairperson presented the Action Taken Report on the suggestions of the previous PAC meeting. After the presentation, she asked Director (L), also a member of the NTM-Subcommittees, to take up the agenda points related to the minutes of the Subcommittees for discussion and approval.

#### **ON TRANSLATION, COPYEDITING RATES ETC:**

The members opined that the Mission should honour translators. To this effect, it was suggested that NTM should raise the bar as far as payment for translators is concerned. At the same time, it is necessary that the proposed rates should be implementable without any objection. The members felt that it was important to make some headway. NTM directly translating a book by engaging its translators was only one way of doing it. Sometimes, NTM may have to conduct workshops for some disciplines involving the subject experts and translators in which there may not be many translators available. NTM may also assign the task to publishers as turnkey projects. Since the present proposal of a three-tiered rate for translation is more than the existing rates paid by government agencies like National Book Trust (NBT), Sahitya Akademi etc and many corporate publishing houses, the suggestions by the Subcommittee on Translation and Copyediting Rates etc were agreed by the members and approved by the Chair.

It was also agreed during the discussions that a midcourse correction should be allowed if NTM does not get translators for the proposed rates. For turnkey projects, the publishers may be allowed, if they chose to pay the translators more than the NTM rates.

#### **ON COPYRIGHT AND LEGAL MATTERS:**

The members felt that the suggestion by the concerned Subcommittee to pay a royalty of five percent for Indian authors and ten percent for non-Indian authors may not be suitable. It was decided that NTM should pay both the Indian and the non-Indian authors an amount of ten percent of royalty on its products.

It was decided that if NTM is engaging a publisher only to print and distribute its camera ready copy (CRC), then NTM should pay royalty on the Maximum Retail Price (MRP). While this is also the practice by NBT and Sahitya Akademi, their representatives informed the Committee that the two agencies do not include the translation fee paid and some other production charges incurred by the project in the product's pricing.

However, the industry practice is to pay on net sales. Hence, it was suggested that in case of turnkey projects, a proposal should be sent to major publishing houses asking for suggestions

and also to find out if they agree to pay royalty on MRP. The members decided that regional publishers should also be included in these processes.

The members decided that copyrights for a book to be translated should be bought into all the 22 languages at one go.

As for the pricing of a translation version was concerned, the members said that it should be competitive. As a matter of policy it should be less than or equal to the price of the original with near equal quality of printing. Quality parameters may be fixed up-front so as to avoid disputes later.

#### **ON DRAFTS OF THE AGREEMENTS:**

The members approved on the five drafts of the agreements with author (legal heir), translator, distributor, publisher and associate editor respectively. The members suggested that NTM should also draft an agreement to be entered into with the General Editor and another one with the publishers for turnkey projects. The draft for the agreement with publishers for turnkey projects should include parameters for ensuring quality, the members said. The same should be done within 6-8 weeks.

#### **ON KNOWLEDGE BOOKS TO BE TRANSLATED:**

The members suggested that since the list of books approved by the members of the Subcommittee on Knowledge Books to be Translated by NTM belonged to only eight disciplines, the list must be expanded to include disciplines like History, Sociology, Mathematics etc and before being placed for approval.

The members suggested that about 10 books, which are acceptable to all, can be selected from the present list to commence the processes of buying translation rights, identifying translators, assigning translations etc. Director CIIL was asked to do this selection and communicate to all over e-mail within 4-6 weeks. The list of books so finalised can be got approved by circulation or in the next PAC meeting.

The Chairperson asked the NTM team to give a detailed presentation of the Knowledge Text Scenario Survey in the next PAC meeting. The presentation should include books suggested by at least three experts of the disciplines along with the information of whether the book had already been translated in any of the Schedules Languages are not, the page number, latest edition etc.

It was suggested that the presentation should include the need for the books in the regional languages and the list of translators to take up the assignment against each book. It was decided that the list should be made public through NTM website and the opinion of teachers and students from various language backgrounds should be recorded.

#### **ON THE SELECTION OF PROJECT DIRECTOR OF NTM:**

The PAC ratified the selection of Dr. Aditi Mukherjee for the post of Project Director, NTM by the Selection Committee headed by the Additional Secretary, MHRD.

**OTHER ISSUES:**

The members decided that NTM should develop *a manual for translators* to be used across languages for its translations. The members suggested that Dr. Vanamala Vishvanatha in consultation with other interested PAC members and leading experts could take the responsibility to develop the manual and to facilitate this process she may be offered a NTM-*fellowship* for a certain period (for which a provision has been made in the Detailed Project Report of NTM).

Two out of a set of 34 logos that was presented were found to be good by the members. They said that a few modifications would make them better. The members also were in favour of announcing **a competition** in national and regional dailies to create a logo for NTM. A set of three prizes involving a total amount of one lakh rupees could be set aside which will also become an important process of dissemination of the NTM idea to potential users.

The members felt that there was no flow of decision making in NTM. The members decided to create an email group to facilitate this. Pending issues can be circulated one by one to members of the PAC and decisions can be taken on the basis of their feedbacks.

The members agreed to the Chairperson's proposal that the next meeting of the PAC should be convened as soon as possible to decide on the knowledge texts to be translated and other actions to be taken. It was decided to have a two day meeting within two months at Mysore.

**CONCLUSION:**

The Member-Secretary thanked all the members and extended his invitation to the members to join at Mysore for the next meeting.

**ACTION POINTS:**

1. Drafts for agreement with publishers for turnkey projects and with General Editor
2. Find out whether publishers will be ready to pay royalty on MRP
3. Develop parameters for ensuring quality in turnkey projects
4. Lists of books for translation should be expanded to include more disciplines
5. A detailed presentation of the knowledge text scenario survey
6. Manual of translation
7. Competition for creating the NTM logo
8. Group email id for the PAC
9. PAC to be convened again in the last week of June, preferably in Mysore.